DRAFT MINUTES OF THE SEVENTY-NINTH MEETING OF ACAF HELD ON 27 JUNE 2019, HELD AT PARK PLAZA HOTEL, VICTORIA, LONDON, SW1V 1EQ

Present:

Chairman Dr Ian Brown

Members Ms Angela Booth Mr Geoff Brown

Ms Ann Davison Dr Tim Riley

Prof. Stephen Forsythe Prof. Robert Smith

Prof. Wendy Harwood Mrs Christine McAlinden

Secretariat Mr Keith Millar (Secretary) Food Standards Agency

Dr Mark Bond Food Standards Agency

Assessors Mr Taranjit Dhansay Food Standards Agency

Mr John Finlay DAERA

Ms Claire Moni Food Standards Scotland

Ms Barbora Adlerová Food Standards Agency Wales

Mr Stephen Wyllie Defra

Officials Mrs Cath Mulholland Food Standards Agency

Mrs Nina Dorian Veterinary Medicines Directorate

Ms Gwen Aherne Food Standards Agency

Ms Ruth Willis Food Standards Agency

Delegates Mr Michael Bellingham Pet Food Manufacturers Association

MORNING SESSION - RISK ASSESSMENT

- Dr Brown welcomed everyone to the meeting and pointed out that the first item on the agenda was reserved business as it was an update for Scientific Advisory Committees (SACs) on work being undertaken on risk analysis (ACAF/19/05). Therefore, delegates will not be invited to listen or participate in this item. They will though be invited to the rest of the meeting.
- 2. Dr Brown reminded Members and delegates that the morning session of the meeting will cover risk assessment issues whilst the afternoon session will cover risk management topics.

- 3. Apologies for absence were received from the following ACAF Members; Professor Ian Givens, Mr Peter Francis and Miss Mandy Jumnoodoo (ACAF Secretariat).
- 4. The Chairman informed members that Dr David Peers had resigned from the Committee on 20 March 2019. Dr Brown thanked Dr Peers for his valuable and long contribution and most excellent support. On behalf of the Committee he wished him well in the future.
- 5. The Chairman advised Members that John Finlay had replaced Alan McCartney as the Northern Ireland Assessor. The Chairman thanked Alan for his contribution to the Committee and wished him well in the future. He invited John to introduce himself. Mr Finlay said that he worked in the Agri-food Inspection branch at DAERA. His background was in delivery of food and feed controls including experience in dairy, eggs and meat.
- 6. The Chairman also welcomed Taranjit Dhansay who had replaced Karen Pratt as the FSA Assessor. The Chairman thanked Karen for her valuable input and work whilst acting as the FSA Assessor and passed on the Committee's best wishes for the future. Taranjit was then invited to introduce himself. Mr Dhansay said that he had worked in technical roles in the retail industry for the previous 15 years and his last role was with Morrison's Online.
- 7. The Secretary clarified the role of assessors and also thanked Alan McCartney and Karen Pratt for their work on the Committee.

Agenda item 3 – Update for SACs on work being undertaken on risk analysis (ACAF/19/05) Reserved business

8. This item was discussed as reserved business.

Agenda Item 1 - Declaration of Members' interests

9. Mr Geoff Brown declared that he was no longer carrying out his role with the British Association of Feed Supplement and Additive Manufacturers and his roles with the Agricultural Industries Confederation. Dr Riley said that he was now a full member of the Board of the UK Beef Shorthorn Society and Professor Harwood advised that she was now a member of the Advisory Committee on Novel Foods and Processes Committee.

Agenda Item 2 - Minutes of the seventy-eighth Meeting (MIN/19/01)

- 10. The minutes were agreed subject to the following amendments:
- Paragraph 23, line 2 amend to read "Dr Riley, revisiting the reason for the work, said that, several members had perceived that regulatory controls should be reviewed."
- Paragraph 25, last sentence, insert brackets amend to read "trace elements (e.g. cobalt, molybdenum) and vitamins."
- Paragraph 35, line 9 amend to read "The Member also asked if there was guidance on advertising formats to ensure that the promotion of raw pet food was not misleading."

Agenda Item 4 – Future plans for SACs

- 11. Ms Cath Mulholland was invited to provide an oral update on the FSA's activities in preparation of the UK's departure from the EU.
- 12. Ms Mulholland advised the Committee of the new structures highlighting that following a recruitment drive, 35 new members had been appointed across joint expert groups (JEGs) and the FSA's Scientific Advisory Committees (SACs). In order to support the work of the SACs, the register of specialists had been further developed with additional experts recruited. The recent Discovery Day was utilised as a formal induction for the new members. JEGs are being established and ways of working and training needs are being addressed, a meeting will be held in the Autumn to begin the groups' work.

Discussion

- 13. Following a question from a Member of the Committee, Ms Mullholland advised that the work of the JEGs would be overseen by their parent Scientific Advisory Committees (SAC) as appropriate, depending on the work concerned. Mrs Willis acknowledged that the Food and Feed JEG was unusual for a regulated product regime due to the diverse scope of the work and could report to three parent committees (COT, ACMSF or ACAF) depending on the issues raised; while the other JEGs generally reported their work to two (COT and ACMSF). It was clarified that members of the JEGs would also be members of the parent SAC (generally COT). Some ACAF members have agreed to be co-opted to serve on the feed JEG or on ACNFP to provide their feed expertise to these groups.
- 14. The Chairman said that Members were confused about their future roles; however, he acknowledged this would be resolved in due course. He was delighted that members of ACAF would continue to give the FSA their independent expert advice. Additionally, the Chairman confirmed that he had

written to an appropriate Member of the Science Council urging that the expertise of ACAF should not be lost or diluted.

Agenda Item 5 - Feed Additives

- 15. Dr Tim Riley, Chairman of the working group on feed additive oversupplementation provided an oral update on the activities of the working
 group. Dr Riley thanked Members of the working group, in particular Dr Mark
 Bond of the FSA for producing a comprehensive literature review working
 paper and a condensed synthesis report. He advised that the group were not
 yet at the stage where they could provide a finished set of recommendations
 to the Committee. However, the group had identified issues and concerns,
 especially around over supplementation of iodine and copper. The finalised
 report, with recommendations, will hopefully be presented at the next meeting
 for discussion and scrutiny by Members.
- 16. A Member of the Committee said that the original concern was regulatory compliance, the reasons why over supplementation was occurring and the consequences. Additionally, Dr Mark Bond advised that the comprehensive working paper had been produced to enable Working Group Members to refine and draw-out key information in the shorter synthesis report. This synthesis report would then be adapted to produce a 2-4-page summary from which key messages could be distilled and conveyed to stakeholders.
- 17. The Chairman thanked the group and Mark Bond for the outstanding work they had produced.

AFTERNOON SESSION - RISK MANAGEMENT

Agenda Item 6- Consultative Committee on Animal Feed

- 18. The ACAF Chairman stated that ACAF, like the other SACs, will only provide advice that relates directly to risk assessment. In terms of risk management, the FSA will still require independent advice on the use of animal feed in relation to human health, the food chain and other topical and emerging issues. Therefore, the Agency is currently considering options for a risk management body. He then invited the ACAF Secretary to provide Members with an oral update.
- 19. The ACAF Secretary said that a business plan was being prepared for the creation of a new risk management body. It was envisaged that the body would meet in open session and report to the FSA and Agriculture departments throughout the UK. The secretariat would remain as currently, with input from representatives from devolved countries. The ACAF Secretary

said that the likely constituents of the body would include experts from industry, enforcement, academia and consumer interests.

Discussion

- 20. The ACAF Chairman acknowledged that the proposed body would remain independent. In response to questions from several Committee Members, the ACAF Secretary stated that the following:
- mitigating the risk of incidents would be the focus of the new body;
- the role of the body would be to provide advice on risk management and risk communication issues;
- the body would continue to provide advice to the FSA and UK Agriculture Ministers.
- 21. The Scottish, Welsh and Northern Ireland Assessors confirmed that they would relay the information to their respective colleagues. The ACAF Secretary advised that he did not envisage any changes in the assessor roles and the aspiration is to retain the status quo. Members would be updated once details had been finalised.

Agenda Item 7 – Feed Additives

22. Following the oral update provided in the morning session by the sub-group Chairman on the activities of the feed additive over-supplementation working group, the Chairman invited Members to provide comments on the best approaches that can be adopted to communicate the risks identified by the sub-group.

Discussion

- 23. A Member of the Committee advised that further work was required to distil the information to identify priorities after which consideration of appropriate communication messages could be taken forward.
- 24. The ACAF Chairman agreed that a simple leaflet which provided the information and recommendations in a succinct form was desirable but questioned how this could be achieved. Another Member of the Committee said that consideration of the target audience was needed. He went on to suggest that a poster may be the best way of highlighting the issue and messages the Committee wished to convey.
- 25. Dr Bond suggested that involvement of the Agency's Social Science team would be appropriate to assist in drawing out tacit behaviours and suitable

channels of communication. A Member of the Committee said it was prudent to work with the Agency's Social Science team to ensure that recommendations being provided could include behaviour change methodology. The member of the Committee also agreed that a poster was a good idea for the farming community and social media for the business to business sector.

- 26. Another Member of the Committee said that continuing professional development modules for feed advisors will begin to raise awareness with that particular population.
- 27. Other Members of the Committee suggested that an article in a publication such as Farmers Weekly or a supplement in the Farmers Guardian could help promote the recommendations.
- 28. The ACAF Chairman agreed that a further discussion on this item was required.

Action: Secretariat

- 29. The Committee agreed that the working group were required to undertake the following actions:
- distil the key messages and in doing so consider the target audience and identification of the best routes and methods for communicating the messages. Ms Davison agreed to help the working group on the communication aspects;
- work with the Agency's social scientists, so that the key drivers could be extracted from the report such that the working group approach could be guided; and
- consider translating the recommendations and advice into Welsh.

Action: Working Group

Agenda Item 8 - Raw pet food (CCAF 19/01)

30. Stephen Wyllie (Defra Assessor) introduced CCAF paper 19/01. Mr Wyllie said he was keen to publish the guidance and that the revised document had addressed previous concerns raised by the Committee. The Chairman invited Members to agree to 'sign-off' the document and for its publication.

Discussion

- 31. Members of the Committee raised the following points:
- three concerns (a) handling of raw pet food; (b) animal infection resulting in human infection; and (c) an asymptomatic animal shedding of *Listeria Monocytogenes* being hazardous to the owner. The USA Centre for Disease Control and Prevention and the Food and Drug Administration recommend not to feed raw pet food. This advice is also in line with veterinary advice. The relevant Member was however content with the document.
- in paragraph 3 the best practices measures could be broadened to include distributors and consumers and the last point under microbiological testing could be expanded to include other vulnerable groups. In addition, a periodic deep clean of food preparation areas should be suggested due to the potential of colonisation of households by the asymptomatic carrier.
- 32. Following a question from the ACAF Chairman, Mr Wyllie (DEFRA) said that the document was primarily for industry and would be available to consumers through the FSA and .gov website.
- 33. Members of the Committee were invited to send any further feedback and comments to Mr Wyllie for consideration and revision of the document
- 34. The ACAF Chairman invited Michael Bellingham Chief Executive of the Pet Food Manufacturers Association (PFMA) to comment.
- 35. Mr Bellingham said that the document was good and that there was commonality with the published PFMA guidance. He stated he would ask the PFMA to incorporate the finalised version into PFMA guidance. Mr Bellingham added that 10 raw pet food manufacturers were currently PFMA members, collectively holding a 60%-65% share of UK raw pet food market. Mr Bellingham commented that an accreditation scheme for members and non-members is being considered, including a process for auditing against the guidance.

Agenda Item 9 - Any Other Business

36. No items were raised under this agenda item.

Next meeting

37. The date of the next ACAF meeting will be 3 October 2019. The venue for the meeting is to be confirmed.¹

ACAF Secretariat
September 2019

 $^{^{\}rm 1}$ Meeting scheduled for 3 October 2019 has been cancelled. Dates for the next meeting will be reviewed in the new year.